Comics as Social Media Criticism of Community Activities Restrictions Enforcement Due to COVID-19 in Indonesia

Vizcardine Audinovic, Rio Satria Nugroho
Universitas Airlangga Surabaya, Indonesia
Email: vizcardine.audinovic-2020@fisip.unair.ac.id

Received: Sept 29, 2021 | Revised: Oct 21, 2021 | Approved: Nov 12, 2021

Abstract: The Government’s policy in dealing with COVID-19 cases, namely in implementing Community Activities Restrictions Enforcement (PPKM) with various inconsistent rules, has triggered criticism from the public, wildly comic artists. Through Instagram, PPKM-themed comics are spread and getting much attention from the public. This study aimed to find out how the use of comics as social criticism in the implementation of PPKM. This study applied a critical metaphor analysis in analyzing the metaphors that appear in voicing the aspirations of opinions and social criticism. The sample selection was based on the comics with the highest engagement from the specified theme. The results showed that 50 comics were criticizing the PPKM policy from 20 accounts. The creators raised six significant metaphors, including PPKM as a prison, PPKM as many types of models, PPKM as a form of greed, Covid-19 is described in social class, the Government is heroes PPKM a form of arrogance. Criticism with satire and humour has received many likes and comments, increasing the sense of social solidarity. The form of criticism on Instagram cannot be underestimated because it has great power to change government policies.

Keywords: Critical Metaphor Analysis; Instagram; Political Comics; PPKM.


Kata kunci: Critical Metaphor Analysis; Instagram; Komik Politik; PPKM.
Introduction

This article examines how social criticism of Community Activities Restrictions Enforcement (Pemberlakuan Pembatasan Kegiatan Masyarakat - PPKM) can be visualized through comics on Instagram. The implementation of PPKM invites the public to express their criticisms through political cartoons on social media. Through Instagram, comic artists can share their ideas, express their ideas, and influence public opinion. This social media also has power that is not inferior to the masses in the offline realm (Ramadhani& Putra, 2017). From previous research, not many have discussed using the CMA paradigm to find out how socio-political phenomena are communicated through metaphors in political comics. For that reason, this paper examines how comics are used as a medium of criticism in CMA paradigm.

In preventing the transmission of the COVID-19 pandemic since March 2021, the Indonesian Government has implemented a large-scale social restriction (PSBB) policy in all cities and provinces or regional quarantine from April to June 2021 (Setiati&Azwar, 2020). It turned out that this policy was considered successful in reducing the surge in new cases, so the government updated the rules with the Transitional PSBB (Wahid et al, 2021). Not enough with PSBB, the Government has again implemented restrictions on community activities (PPKM) in the Java-Bali region on January 11-25, 2021 due to the high number of COVID-19 cases after the Christmas and New Year holidays. In contrast to the PSBB, PPKM still provides space for business and office activities to operate on the condition that capacity restrictions and strict health protocols must be implemented (Andryanto, 2021).

The Government’s policies are prolonged and tend to be inconsistent in handling COVID-19, it triggers people’s attitudes to express various opinions and criticisms. The public considers the Government not serious in dealing with the COVID-19 spread rate (Djalante, et al., 2020). Not infrequently, social media is also a forum for the community to channel their criticisms regarding the policies made by the Government (Tsao et al, 2020). These social criticisms and opinions are expressed in various ways, from writing down their thoughts, making jokes, petitions, and making comic strips or specific illustrations.

The corona virus (COVID-19) pandemic ended everyday human life in all societies and it has become a global threat. To combat the COVID-19 spread rate, the Government has implemented many measures and policies, including social distancing restrictions,
travel bans, and healthy living practices such as washing hands, wearing masks, exercising at home, and eating nutritious food (Moudy & Syakurah, 2020). The pandemic has changed the pattern of human contact in society due to changes in human mobility (Al Husain, 2020). The social restriction policy in Indonesia is referred to as large-scale social restrictions (PSBB) in all cities and provinces or regional quarantine from April to June 2021 (Setiati & Azwar, 2020). Due to the official policy to stay at home, people have started doing many activities at home, such as working from home and schooling from home.

The consequence of the PSBB is that the space for human movement becomes limited. The PSBB was implemented at that time was considered successful in reducing the spike in new cases, so the Government updated the rules with the Transitional PSBB (Wahid et al., 2021). Not satisfied with the PSBB, the Government has again adopted a Community Activities Restrictions Enforcement (PPKM) policy in the Java-Bali region on January 11-25, 2021. However, PPKM is a policy that has continued until mid-2021 (Andryanto, 2021). Because the Government’s policies are prolonged and tend to be inconsistent in handling COVID-19, it triggers people's attitudes to express various opinions and criticisms. The public considers the Government not serious in dealing with the COVID-19 spread rate (Djalante et al., 2020). Not infrequently, social media is also a forum for the community to channel their criticisms regarding the policies made by the Government (Tsao et al., 2020). These social criticisms and opinions are expressed in various ways, from writing down their thoughts, making jokes, petitions, and making comic strips or specific illustrations.

The authors will focus on comics or illustrations as a form of social criticism commonly called political cartoons. Political cartoons are receiving increasing scientific attention, as evidenced by several studies on how these prime examples of multimodal discourse communicate with the targeted readers. It uses metaphors and other cognitive tools to generate preferred political and social reality perceptions (Silaški & Urović, 2019). Political cartoons, according to El Refaie (2009), are images, usually in one panel, that are published on the editorial or opinion pages of newspapers and may refer to current political events or famous figures, but in a way that takes a stand or offers a particular point of view. The problem raised by the authors is how comics perceived as a medium of social criticism in the implementation of PPKM in Indonesia. Therefore, this
study aims to determine how comics are used as a medium of social criticism in implementing PPKM.

Comics themselves are not new as a medium in voicing the aspirations of the Indonesian people. The comic strips popularity has been uniquely acknowledged among Indonesian people in specific communication contexts, such as social media, magazines, and newspapers (Fallianda, Astiti, & Hanim, 2018). In the post-democratic post-reform era, the presence of comics gives its nuance to media connoisseurs because the audience is invited to examine the social problems that are currently happening (Noviasri, 2019).

It is raised through satire with a critical humour style to invite and voice orders to disseminate opinions, criticisms, and appeals in the COVID-19 pandemic situation through cartoon discourse that raises news issues that are developing and currently in the community (Sani, Budiarsa, Laksana, & Save, 2021). Comics may describe and communicate spatial, temporal, and relational features (Callender, Obuobi, Czerwiec, & Williams, 2020). Comics in social media can depict social, bodily, and geographic boundaries that have been limited by pandemics, reconfiguration of social interactions, and emotional responses to things like physical distancing and risk of infection by harnessing the power of visuals and portraying multiple perspectives. Most of the COVID-19 pandemic cartoon themes use anthropomorphic and figurative means to depict government acts, medical forces’ desperate resistance, and the virus’s global impact (Wang, 2021).

In the depiction of phenomena in comics, the relationship between the actual and the imaginary is metaphorical. As a result, readers are encouraged to map the meaning from a more natural to a more abstract realm of reality (Silaški & urović, 2019). Most metaphorical messages in political cartoons are delivered visually, while metaphors in cartoons also include verbal signals. To fully comprehend the visual metaphors of political cartoons, they must be examined in the context of a particular socio-political environment (El Refaie, 2009). Therefore, the author uses the Critical Metaphor Analysis (CMA) paradigm to analyze the metaphors that arise to voice opinions and social criticism aspirations. Muslof’s (2016) view on political discourse metaphors, is that metaphors always have a practical purpose, such as expressing an opinion on the topic under discussion. This critical approach to metaphor analysis tries to make explicit political and ideological intentions if not tacit or concealed.
The socio-cultural context in which metaphors occur, as well as how metaphors are used to shape the social reality of a topic, are also highlighted by CMA. Additionally, CMA is a paradigm that asserts that metaphors, which include words and concepts as a whole, improve understanding of specific concepts and ideas (Musolff, 2016). It is significant in political discourse in various contexts, where complex ideas and concepts must sometimes be simplified to understand them. Narratives and metaphors enable comic creators to apply source concepts to target readers and utilize them to build narrative frameworks for conceptualizing and assessing socio-political issues (Silaški & Urović, 2019). In addition, this aspect is to turn this narrative into a discourse tradition that has emerged and is a characteristic of their respective communities.

Darmawan (2016) conducted a study of various visual modalities of cotton in the post-reformation era. Using the critical discourse analysis (CDA) method, his study showed that Indonesian cartoonists are strongly influenced by Hollywood films and popular culture in expressing their opinions and criticisms. The metaphor of the Indonesian president is expressed in various characters and models, such as the "Hulk" character. Fallianda, Asti, & Hanim (2018) conducted a study to analyze the meaning of humour in newspaper comic strips in various combinations of inappropriate multimodal rhetoric. It demonstrates that puns, hyperbole, analogy, parallelism, or verbal metaphor and contradiction create humour in the text alone and the interplay between the two semiotic modes (either complementary or conflicting).

Permana (2020) investigated the semiotic interpretation of President Jokowi's cartoons in the Jakarta Post e-paper for hidden meanings and messages. Using the semiotics and CDA paradigms, this study demonstrates how linguistics may transmit messages such as speech choices. Irony and sarcasm are the most common rhetorical devices used in the five cartoons. Rutherford (2020) examined how Latin cartoonists employed parody and satire, a genre-style wrench, to help their audiences comprehend and cope with the physical and societal afflictions brought on by the global COVID-19 pandemic. His research suggests that social activism acts as a potent shaping tool in this social media-based cartoon discourse, assisting followers in processing and coping with unpleasant reality while symbolically challenging political leaders' speech.

Seixas (2021) investigated how government officials use the metaphor of war for various goals in crisis communication and management of the current pandemic. This study applies the CDA method with the crisis communication paradigm carried out by
the Government. This study resulted in the metaphor of war with a pandemic showing the Government’s strategy to invite the community to fight the spread of the virus together. The metaphor of war is often used to pursue specific goals of communication and crisis management. However, the Government’s communication efforts to the community still cannot be optimized in cooperation with the European Union.

The previous research has not discussed the political comics in the CMA paradigm to find out how political media communicate socio-political phenomena through metaphors. Moreover, only a few research-based on textual analysis has focused on the COVID-19 in the Asian context. Because of this gap, we will conduct a study using the CMA paradigm to analyze the Indonesian political cartoons on Instagram.

**Method**

This study uses a qualitative approach, and the method uses the Critical Metaphor Analysis (CMA) paradigm by Muslof (2016). Qualitative research aims to create representations based on in-depth and specific cases of certain phenomena (Neuman, 2014). In identifying visual and multimodal metaphors, the author uses a multimodal approach in terms of cognitive, initiated by Bounegru & Forceville (2011). Monomodal or multimodal metaphors are the main focus in this analysis because the Indonesian political comics could depend on verbal and visual modalities. Therefore, we identified the criteria of metaphors that occurred in Indonesian political comics as the first step. Then, we organized the collected data and classified them into several groups to identify the visual metaphor.

The criteria given by Bounegru & Forceville (2011) for metaphors are: (1) the existence of identity relations created in the relationship between phenomena, (2) phenomena are understood as targets and sources of various modalities, and (3) there is one character or connotation made. Instagram is the primary social media source in data collection because of the wealth of features and popularity among the Indonesian people. Data collection is done by searching and identifying Instagram accounts of popular Indonesian comic creators with over 3,000 followers and creating PPKM-themed content. The identification results found that 20 comic creator accounts consisted of 3 verified accounts by Instagram, such as @micecartoon @jukihoki and @komikazer and the remaining 17 were accounts with over 3,000 followers.

**Results and Discussion**
It is worth noting that cartoons are only employed in a visual sense here. Most social issues, such as abortion, have political repercussions, and most political issues, such as 9/11, have social and cultural implications, therefore humorous writings that may or may not have verbal and political aspects are employed in a very narrow sense (Permana, 2020). A political cartoon is a type of visual modal discourse that mixes image and linguistic symbolism. It features several multimodal metaphors and ideological and real-life cartoons that provide insight into their philosophy (Ma & Gao, 2020). In other words, political cartoons present fictional stories set in fictional environments, but their narratives are based on real-life events and personalities.

From 20 creators, 50 comics were found that criticized PPKM from January 2021 to July 2021. Most of these comics criticized the Government, and the rest criticized the behaviour of the community in dealing with PPKM. A certain period was chosen because PPKM started from that period until now. The sample selection is determined from comics with the highest number of engagements from a predetermined theme. There are six significant metaphorical themes. The most widely adopted by creators include PPKM as a prison, PPKM as many types of models, PPKM as a form of greed, Covid-19 is described in social class, the Government is a hero and PPKM as a form of arrogance. Meanwhile, the most significant and most prominent comic account in making comics about PPKM is @micecartoon

Figure 1. Jukihoki
Institutional and multimodal depictions of the cognitive instruments used serve to identify roles, relationships, and storylines from scenarios given the roles filled in political comics (Musolff, 2016). Not only does it help to frame the relationship between the two participants of this discourse, but the depiction in the metaphor also identifies the related evaluations used in the multimodal political cartoon discourse regarding PPKM. The most dominant metaphor in comic political discourse about PPKM is the metaphor of PPKM as a prison for the community, as illustrated in Figure 1. PPKM can be interpreted as a lockdown on a regional scale. Some people have compared the COVID-19 lockdown to prisons because of the enforced lockdown (Dhami, Weiss-Cohen, & Ayton, 2020). It is not surprising that prison becomes a metaphor for PPKM which the concept is closely related to lockdown. The metaphor exists by comparing the psychological condition of society in general with the mental condition of people in prison. Lockdown causes dissatisfaction, boredom, and feelings of isolation due to diminished physical touch, absence of typical routines, lack of social contact with others, and inability to acquire goods and services (Brooks et al., 2020). Furthermore, the COVID-19 lockdown may be linked to deficient levels of mental well-being in society as a whole, as evidenced by the mental health of jail inmates (Hossain, Ali, Khan, & Ahsan, 2020).
In addition, Figure 1 also illustrates the form of criticism of the Indonesian Government’s policy of implementing PPKM for its citizens but still accepting the arrival of foreign nationals. Political cartoons are used to pressure specific issues as a form of criticism to maintain pressure on the Government (Ghilzai, 2020). In this case, the cartoonist in Figure 1 criticizes the Government through the metaphor of PPKM as a prison and a character who allows several other characters with blonde hair to enter Indonesian territory. It began with the Indonesian government’s decision to broaden the categories of foreign nationals permitted entry into the country in the wake of the COVID-19 outbreak (Ani, 2021). On the other hand, some regions must implement strict PPKM. Therefore, comic Figure 1 criticizes the two government policies which are considered contradictory.

Figure 2. *Si Belang*

Figure 2 shows nine pictures that explain the various types of PPKM terms that have been applied in Indonesia since the beginning of the PSBB. The metaphor depicted in figure 2 is a small child, the striped character parodying PPKM terms to a friend. The character describes various PPKM terms by using a mask that covers his entire face. The mask characters used include Kamen Rider, Satpol PP, and Avengers characters such as Ultron, Thanos, and Iron Man. Figure 2 illustrates criticism of the provision of the term PPKM which continues to change periodically. At the same time, at a practical level, this policy cannot solve the existing problems. Similar to the study conducted by Darmawan
(2016) that character metaphors are used using figures in popular culture. The depiction of media messages related to western popular culture reflects the life experiences of several aspects of society (Caliendo, 2020). The discussion of public criticism in political cartoons includes gathering facts and events in a particular context or in the form of opinions and editorials, which is a real effort to persuade readers or viewers from a certain point of view. The comic also describes the striped friend's hair turning white in the term Emergency Endgame PPKM. Because PPKM continues to be extended every week, it is impossible to predict when it will end.

Figure 3. Komikluks

Another prominent metaphor in the comic political discourse about PPKM is describing public panic buying, as in figure 3. PPKM makes people from the upper class buy all basic needs to feel safe and secure during the PPKM era. Governments consider the socioeconomic variables of panic purchasing and hoarding due to a substantial income effect on panic buying. It also allows for identifying places and situations where the most vulnerable people's prospective requirements may arise to avert social panic, looting, and supply shortages. (Yoshizaki, 2003). et al., 2020). In this context, upper-class consumers are blamed for buying essential goods too early in large quantities, causing
price increases, stock runs out, and long queues at stores (Islam, et al., 2021). Thus, the impulsiveness of the upper-class society becomes a trigger for existing social criticism.

Figure 3 illustrates criticism of people who do panic buying because they lack concern for others. This form of greed is illustrated by several people lining up at the supermarket with piles of masks, instant noodles, rice, and hand sanitisers. People standing in line are depicted as monkeys, wearing clown makeup while naked, donkeys wearing coats, and some look relaxed while looking at the queue. It is what makes PPKM a form of greed for the upper class.

Figure 4 illustrates the metaphor of community groups with the level of vaccine acceptance in Indonesia. The emergence of a vaccine that the Government predicts as one of the solutions to prevent Covid has drawn various reactions in the community. Micecartoon.co.id illustrates at least four groups of how people react to the COVID-19 vaccine. Some groups believe this group is depicted as an adult male wearing glasses and a mask and looking neat with the text "I have been vaccinated!". The next group considers vaccines to be a business ploy depicted by an adult man wearing a singlet and a sarong without wearing a mask. The character has a text bubble, which reads, "No! Just business stuff." The third group depicts an adult woman wearing a head covering and a
negligee, who is afraid of being vaccinated because she is worried about the symptoms and side effects. The character is not wearing a mask, and with a text bubble, it says, "That symptom lol." describes doubt and fear. The last is the group that feels forced. The group is depicted with an adult man wearing neat clothes, nametags, glasses and masks. The character has a text bubble, which reads, "So things go smoothly". It describes the working class who receive vaccines assuming all their professional affairs will be more straightforward with certificates or certificates of having received vaccines.

This metaphor of criticism to society Figure 4 illustrates the Indonesian people's level of acceptance and perception towards the COVID-19 vaccine. According to Sharun et al. (2020), public perception of vaccine benefits and risks is a significant barrier to vaccine acceptance. Various factors influence vaccination acceptance, including geography, time of day, social class, contextual human behavior, and ethnicity (Habersaat & Jackson, 2020). In their survey study, Harapan et al. (2020) revealed that retirees had poorer vaccination acceptance than those who worked as civil servants. Lower vaccine uptake among the elderly may be due to a lower perception of danger.
Figure 5 of Poliklitik's account illustrates that this country is facing a difficult situation. The Government in this comic is illustrated as a hero in this pandemic period and has a satirical meaning. The metaphor in the comic depicts the figure of President Jokowi, related to Indonesian ministers such as Minister of Finance Sri Mulyani, Minister of Health Budi Gunadi, Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs Luhut Binsar Panjaitan as Coordinator of Emergency PPKM, Coordinating Minister for Economic Affairs Airlangga Hartarto, Head of BNPB Ganip Warsito. The president and the ministers are in one unified image, such as the poster illustration for The Avengers who unite to fight the nation's main enemy, COVID-19. The selection of The Avengers film as the central theme of this cartoon is because the film has a long storyline, series, and has an unexpected storyline. These three characteristics are equated with the establishment of PPKM in Indonesia and the Government as the leading actor. Not only figures in the Government but also other figures who have invited the public to fight against COVID-19 in their way, such as dr. Tirta, DeddyCorbuzier, Jerinx SID, and dr. Siti Fadillah Supari, with smaller image sizes. Similar to Figure 3, Figure 5 takes the theme of popular culture from the West.

Satir and political humor are more commonly used to criticize and ridicule the ruling government, political opponents, or protest the current economic, political, social, and cultural conditions (Suherman, 2020). The use of satire and political humour appeals to active political participants and aids in forming opinions for others who do not actively participate in political issues and debates (Kulkarni, 2017). While various viewers or readers may interpret political satire differently based on their motive, viewing orientation, or personal politics, most viewers or readers describe political satire as amusement. The political aspect ranks after entertainment considerations (Becker, 2007). 2020). In other words, the elements of entertainment and humour are the main aspects of political satire for the general public.
Figure 6 of Jukihoki depicts PPKM as a form of arrogance. The metaphor in the comic is the arrogance shown by officials who are issuing two statements in two different situations. The first situation is when officials always promise to put the community first and the Juki figure does not issue a statement during the campaign period. Then during a pandemic where the hospital was always full of patients, the officials asked for a particular hospital to be made for them. They immediately would receive service without the need to queue. The character Juki issued a written text bubble, "Ok Pebejat, Eh Pejabat", which satirises the government image. Figure 6 uses political satire in the form of a word game. This metaphor is due to one politician who asked for a particular hospital to treat the House of Representatives (DPR) members.

The politician's opinion illustrates the lack of empathy for people facing the COVID-19 pandemic and injustice. Political cartoons provide a transcultural arena to convey the social critique offered by these cartoonists, not just for the communities they represent, but also for allies who advocate for justice and social equality (Rutherford, 2020). Cartoonists' joking and laughing actions can emphasize specific communal values, thereby increasing a sense of social solidarity (Ho, Progler, & Vuong, 2021).
Social media provides space for comic artists who used only to express their aspirations in print media but have become more expansive. Comics can share their ideas and express them, implemented democratically, influencing public opinion (Ramadhani & Putra, 2017). The form of protest, innuendo and criticism from comics that have received many likes and comments from fellow Instagram users is a form of community solidarity in dealing with the policies implemented in PPKM.

The function of comics as part of popular culture is to provide entertainment for its readers. In its development, communication has become an effective means to convey criticism about authority or changes in values that occur in society. Effective here because messages wrapped in humorous cartoon images can disguise the extreme side of criticism without reducing the content of the message itself. From comics directly or indirectly, comic artists invite the public to understand the topics interpreted by comic creators (Laksono, 2004). In other words, the images presented in comics are a means to encourage change and as discourse and education for the community (Suprayuni & Juwariyah, 2019). Political comics and cartoons that get a lot of likes and comments will become viral and attract the attention of many users. They are expected to change government policies that are inappropriate or make the government dialogue with its citizens. The comics invite the public to think that this is their condition and whether the public feels the same way through a touch of humour.

The humour in this comic is used to understand the current pandemic situation better. Humour can produce contradictory states of mind and it can persuade someone to act according to a comic artist’s opinion or be indifferent to the problem at hand. On the other hand, joking through humour and laughter can emphasize specific communal values, thereby increasing the sense of social solidarity (Ho, Progler, & Vuong, 2021). The power of humour and comedy is implemented in comics to spread information and generate critical thinking that leads to social activism in social media. Based on shared collective identities, social media activism is defined as networks of social contacts involving a plurality of individuals, groups, and organizations engaged in political or cultural issues (Stewart & Schultze, 2019). The element of satire in some comics reflects the discrepancy between the regulations and the reality on the ground. Political satire in cyberspace can generate new forms of public engagement and participatory culture (Skoric, Zhu, & Pang, 2016).
The results of this study are significant as a reflection of government policies and the attitude of community solidarity over the current situation. Comics have an essential role as a product of the popular culture in conveying discourse and a tool for criticism in Indonesia. Moreover, criticism of government policies still cannot fully side with the community and benefit the upper class or particular groups. People are increasingly encouraged to discursively interpret and explain their lives due to government decisions and collective identities (Jedwab, Khan, Russ, & Zaveri, 2021). This study has also described how criticism can provide new insights on how PPKM has been running until now. Thus, the novelty of the study explains how political comics construct social solidarity in cyberspace. When more personally motivated and affect-driven solidarity emerges in cyberspace, collective action from social solidarity is enacted. It actively demonstrates the existence of social conflicts that exist between the upper and lower classes.

**Conclusion**

Comics on Instagram can be said to be successful as a medium of social criticism in implementing PPKM. When the space for human movement is limited outside the network, it does not mean that the community has lost a place to express its aspirations. Comics use social media technology to work and express opinions and critiques in the implementation of PPKM. It turned out that the criticism poured through political comics on Instagram got many responses and invited sympathy from netizens. The criticism through the Instagram comics invites the public to reflect on whether the community feels this condition. In the implementation of PPKM, the most prominent criticisms include PPKM as a prison for small people, PPKM as a form of government inconsistency, PPKM as a form of greed for upper-class people, and PPKM as a form of greed for upper-class people a form of government arrogance. The element of humor in the comic makes it easier for netizens to understand the current pandemic situation.

The form of community support through giving likes and comments until the comic becomes viral is undoubtedly a form of community involvement. Community involvement has been formed from the collective values which relate to the concept of social solidarity. Currently, viral collective protests and criticism in cyberspace cannot be underestimated because it has great power to make a social movement, as in any
protest in the real world. It is hoped that the viral criticism can change government policies or discourage the Government from dialogue with its citizens.

References


