Treatment of Learning Anxiety: A Bibliometric Review in Islamic Psychology

Widodo Winarso 1, Onwardono Rit Riyanto 2

1 Institut Agama Islam Negeri Syekh Nurjati Cirebon, Indonesia; widodoiain@gmail.com
2 Institut Agama Islam Negeri Syekh Nurjati Cirebon, Indonesia; onwardonorr@gmail.com

Abstract
This study provides a bibliometric review of research on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology, which involved a systematic search in multiple databases, resulting in 91 relevant studies for analysis. The bibliometric data generated from the investigation, identification, and extraction processes were analyzed using statistical analysis. The study found that cognitive behavioral therapy, acceptance and commitment therapy, and stress reduction therapy were the most commonly used methods to treat learning anxiety. Furthermore, most studies were conducted in the United Kingdom and the United States, which suggests a need for further research in other regions. Studies found that the most frequently discussed topics on treating learning anxiety in Islamic psychology were psychological interventions, educational practices, and the impact of Islamic beliefs and practices on learning anxiety. Additionally, the study identified variations in the quality of studies, with some demonstrating high quality while others indicating a risk of bias. This paper emphasizes the importance of conducting further research on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology, particularly in other regions. These findings could be valuable for academics, researchers, and psychology practitioners interested in treating learning anxiety and educators seeking to better understand and address this issue in their students. Further studies can focus on developing therapy models tailored to Islamic Psychology’s principles to provide more optimal outcomes in addressing learning anxiety.

Keywords
Educational Practices; Islamic Psychology; Learning Anxiety; Psychological Interventions; Treatment

Corresponding Author
Widodo Winarso
Institut Agama Islam Negeri Syekh Nurjati Cirebon, Indonesia; widodoiain@gmail.com

© 2023 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC-BY-SA) license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/).

Published by Institut Agama Islam Sunan Giri (INSURI) Ponorogo; Indonesia
Accredited Sinta 2
1. INTRODUCTION

The education that has been implemented has experienced many psychological problems in students. Various studies conducted in multiple countries, it was found that a large number of students experience learning anxiety. Research (Dyrbye et al., 2006) aimed to systematically review the prevalence and severity of depression, anxiety, and other indicators of psychological distress in students in the United States and Canada. The study reviewed 47 articles published between 1980 and 2005. The study found that the prevalence of depression ranged from 9% to 31%, while the majority of anxiety ranged from 13% to 45%. The same thing also happened in Indonesia, where the study examined symptoms of depression and anxiety in students in Indonesia. The study involved 463 students from four universities in Indonesia. The results showed that 43.9% of medical students experienced moderate to severe depressive symptoms, and 54.4% experienced moderate to severe anxiety symptoms (Ramadianto et al., 2022). Anxiety is a common experience for many students, especially in learning. Learning anxiety can harm students’ academic performance and overall health. Over the years, much research has been conducted to understand the nature of learning anxiety and to develop effective treatments to reduce it (Evans, 2016; Carpenter et al., 2019; Walter et al., 2020).

Many studies on the Treatment of Learning Anxiety usually focus on various methods and approaches to manage and address anxiety experienced by individuals in the context of learning and education. These studies typically involve psychological interventions (Ong & Chua, 2021; Ryan et al., 2022), cognitive-behavioral therapy (Lorenzo-Luaces et al., 2016; Wenzel, 2017), pharmacological treatment (Patel et al., 2018), and other forms of therapy intended to alleviate symptoms of learning anxiety (Patel et al., 2018), enhance coping mechanisms (Hamzah et al., 2018), and improve academic performance (Albulescu et al., 2023). The goal is to offer effective treatment options that can assist students in overcoming their anxiety, optimizing their learning potential, and achieving academic objectives. However, mapping studies on Islamic psychological treatments related to learning anxiety are lacking. The study of Islamic psychological treatment is of significant urgency. Constructing a research syntax in bibliometrics involves the following elements: keywords, operators, search filters, and displaying data by viewers. Therapies based on the principles of Islamic psychology can provide a holistic approach to overcoming learning anxiety, including from a religious and psychological perspective. The information from this bibliometric review can also help practitioners and researchers select appropriate methods, identify knowledge gaps that still need to be researched, and improve the effectiveness of learning anxiety treatment in Islamic Psychology.

The study aims to provide an overview of research conducted on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology. Through this bibliometric review, the study aims to: Firstly, the research aims to identify the current research trends in the treatment of learning anxiety within the context of Islamic Psychology. Through a comprehensive bibliometric review, this study will uncover the most frequently discussed topics and commonly utilized approaches, providing a deeper understanding of the recent advancements in research in this field. Secondly, the research seeks to evaluate the quality of previous studies on treating learning anxiety in Islamic Psychology. By analyzing methodological rigor, study design, and potential biases, this research will shed light on the reliability and validity of existing studies while identifying areas that require improvement for future investigations. Lastly, the studies endeavor to identify knowledge gaps and propose future research directions in treating learning anxiety within Islamic Psychology.

The argument in this research is based on presenting a bibliometric review of studies on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology. The studies on learning anxiety in the context of Islamic psychology are highly relevant, given the emphasis on consciousness and spirituality in Islamic teachings. Islamic psychology is a new field that refers to Islamic theology, philosophy, and spirituality to develop a holistic understanding of human psychology (Abu-Raiya & Pargament, 2015). This study seeks to contribute to the literature on the treatment of learning anxiety by examining the effectiveness of various interventions in Islamic psychology. By identifying the most effective treatments, this study
can provide insights that can help educators and mental health professionals develop effective strategies for addressing learning anxiety in students. Bibliometric analysis is a quantitative method to evaluate and analyze literature on a specific topic. This analysis provides insights into research trends, influential authors, and works most frequently cited in a particular field. This bibliometric review focuses on studies published in the last ten years and utilizes various academic databases to identify relevant studies.

2. METHOD

Study Design

The study systematically evaluated the literature on learning anxiety in the context of Islamic psychology treatment and revealed their bibliometric characteristics. The bibliometric analysis permits the identification of research trends within publications and facilitates detailed content examination (Diem & Wolter, 2013). In conducting the bibliometric review, they used various academic databases to search for relevant studies on the treatment of learning anxiety during a specific period between 2012 and 2021. The studies that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria were then analyzed based on the research methods used, the treatments evaluated, and the reported effectiveness of the treatments. This bibliometric study did not involve human participants, did not collect primary data, did not manipulate independent variables, or performed statistical analysis to test hypotheses. Therefore, no special ethical procedures were required in this study. Through the bibliometric method, this study is expected to contribute to the identification of effective treatments for learning anxiety within the framework of Islamic psychology, thus helping educators and mental health professionals develop more effective and evidence-based treatment strategies. The assessment was reported based on the PRISMA guidelines (Moher et al., 2009). The PRISMA flow diagram showing the flow of search in the identification and screening of sources for analysis is presented in Figure 1. In bibliometrics research, the used approach is the comparative Approach. The comparative approach involves comparing bibliometric data across different categories or dimensions. This study compares publication and citation patterns across countries, institutions, research fields, and the distribution of journals. Analysis techniques in bibliometrics are Descriptive Statistics, Citation Analysis, Co-citation Analysis, Mapping and Visualization.

![Figure 1. PRISMA flow diagram; PRISMA: Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses](image)
Data Search and Identification

Data search and identification were conducted using several academic databases, including Scopus and Web of Science. The data search was completed in March 2023 by entering several keywords such as “learning anxiety,” “Islamic psychology,” “treatment,” and other related keywords. After that, studies that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria were identified (Li et al., 2021; Dol et al., 2021). The inclusion criteria in this study included studies that examined the treatment of learning anxiety in the context of Islamic psychology, studies published in English, and those published between 2012 and 2021. Meanwhile, the exclusion criteria included irrelevant studies, studies not available online, and those not meeting the inclusion criteria. After conducting the data search and identifying studies that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria, these were downloaded and saved in a special folder for further analysis. Through this process, the authors aimed to provide comprehensive and relevant information regarding the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology.

Data Extraction

Data extraction was performed after studies that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria were identified through the data search and identification process. Data extraction was done by reading and examining each study downloaded and saved in a special folder. The information extracted included the article title, authors, year of publication, the journal where the article was published, research subject, research methods, and main findings. In addition, data extraction was also carried out to obtain information on the methods of treating learning anxiety used in the relevant studies. The extracted information consisted of several analyses, including the most contributive countries and institutions, the journals that publish articles examining the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology, the thematic trends of publications, the trends of methods used in publications, and the populations, samples, and study groups used in publications. After all relevant information was extracted, the data was analyzed and presented in tables and graphs to provide a clear and easily understandable overview of the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology.

Through this data extraction process, the study hopes to provide accurate and comprehensive information on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology that can be useful for academics, researchers, and practitioners. To prevent errors, considering many articles subject to the study, the researchers independently determined the top 91 most-cited publications to be included in the current study’s analysis. Next, the dataset was finalized by cross-matching the researchers’ lists, each consisting of 91 articles. In addition, the same researchers independently reviewed and evaluated the merged top 91 most-cited publications list to increase the research’s reliability and refine it as necessary. Differences in opinion were discussed until a consensus was reached among the researchers, and field experts were also consulted where essential to ensure an agreement was reached.

Statistical Analysis

The present study focused on the top 91 most-cited publications that exclusively investigated the Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology. The scrutinization was carried out based on different aspects, including the subject matter, the journal, the countries/institutions involved, the methodology, the population/sample/study group, the data collection tools, the statistical techniques, and the time taken to publish (Attride-Stirling, 2001). A bibliometric approach and content analysis were used to analyze the Scopus and Web of Science data.

The bibliometric data obtained from the data search, identification, and extraction processes were subjected to statistical analysis (Eker et al., 2019). Microsoft Excel and bibliometric software VOSviewer were used for this purpose. The extracted bibliometric data was first imported into Excel for descriptive and statistical analyses, including frequency, distribution, and interrelationships between variables (Siekelova & Podhorska, 2020). Next, VOSviewer was used to create network graphs and keyword maps to visualize the bibliometric data. This analysis aimed to identify the most commonly discussed topics
in studies on treating learning anxiety in Islamic psychology and the relationships between these topics. Additionally, statistical analysis was conducted to assess the quality of these studies using quality assessment tools such as bias risk assessment and research methodology quality assessment. Through this statistical analysis process, the authors aimed to provide comprehensive and accurate results on studies on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology and information on research trends and quality in this field.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

The study describes the critical results of analyzing the Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic psychology. The findings are categorized into five main themes: journal, country and institution, thematic trend, method, population/sample/study group, data collection tool, and time of publication. These themes were chosen, emphasizing the critical aspects of research questions and representing the solutions or meanings provided to those questions. Additionally, the distribution of the top 91 most cited articles is visually represented in Figure 2, which displays the number of publications and average citations articles over a while.

![Figure 2](image)

**Figure 2.** The Descriptive Characteristics of The Top 91 Most-Cited Publications

Figure 2 shows that the number of publications on learning anxiety was quite high in 2016 but gradually decreased in the following years. The citation data from articles indicates that the number of citations follows the same trend as the number of publications. Therefore, it can be concluded that researchers’ and journals’ interest in studies on learning anxiety tends to increase gradually.

**Theme 1: Analysis of Most Contributive Countries and Institutions with The Most Publications on Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology**

Regarding the relationship between learning anxiety in Islamic psychology as the main theme within the scope of current research, the contribution of "state and institution" to publications investigating the relationship between learning anxiety and Islamic psychology is analyzed, and the findings obtained are presented separately in Table 1 (publications and citations), Figure 3 (for state) and Figure 4 (for the institution).
Table 1. Number of Publications by Country Based on the 91 Most-Cited Publications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Cited by</th>
<th>Citation Density</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>30.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>62.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>3177</td>
<td>62.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>61.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Countries that contributed to at least three publications are included in Table 1.

If we examine Table 1, it can be seen that among the authors of the 91 most cited publications, researchers come from various countries. Furthermore, the five countries with the most contributing researchers to the publications are the United States (f = 31), United Kingdom (f = 51), Germany (f = 4), Netherlands (f = 3), Australia (f = 1), and Switzerland (f = 1). Additionally, researchers from more than one country also participated in some studies.

The bibliometric research conducted between 2012 and 2021 on treatment for learning anxiety in Islamic psychology resulted in 5 main findings. Firstly, based on the presented bibliometric results, most research on learning anxiety in Islamic psychology is published in the United Kingdom and the United States (Burns et al., 2020; Islam et al., 2015; Tineo et al., 2021). This indicates that the research centers and scientific journals related to this topic are in these countries. Several factors may influence the dominance of the UK and the US in research on learning anxiety in Islamic psychology, such as the fact that both countries have many renowned universities and research institutions in psychology and social sciences (Kaplick & Skinner, 2017). Additionally, the Muslim population is increasing both in the UK and the US (Ogan et al., 2014), which has spurred the growth of research on Islamic psychology in these two countries. The research results indicate that most global Muslim mental health research is conducted in these countries, making them the most prolific publishers of such research (Altalib et al., 2019; Shakoor et al., 2022). However, despite the majority of research being published in the UK and the US, this article also suggests that further research needs to be conducted in Muslim countries and outside of the countries mentioned above to broaden the understanding of treatment for learning anxiety in Islamic psychology and expand the knowledge base in this field.

Figure 3. shows the cooperation network of the countries. We can see the pattern of international collaboration where some countries have made significant contributions. In this context, British scientists have collaborated with researchers from various countries. Countries like America, Australia, and Canada also have strong research collaboration networks related to learning anxiety in Islamic psychology. However, the study results show that several other countries, such as Belgium, Singapore, Brazil, the Netherlands, Austria, Ireland, and others, are not involved in international research collaborations.
Figure 3. Co-Occurrence Network of Most Contributive Countries

Figure 4 shows a density visualization map of the most contributive institutions. It can be seen that among the 91 most cited publications, there are researchers from 50 different universities and higher education institutions. Additionally, the institutions with the highest number of sequentially publishing researchers are the Columbia Department of Medicine, University of Utah, Tulane University School of Medicine, Columbia University Irving Medical Center, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, and several others. As the total contribution from all institutions is 50 (out of the total 91 publications analyzed in this study), the data indicates that collaboration between collaborating institutions worldwide is very low.

Figure 4. Density Visualization Map of The Most Contributive Institutions

**Theme 2: Analysis of The Journals That Publish the Articles That Examined the Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology**

The second main theme within the scope of this research is "journals" that publish articles that investigate the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology.
Table 2. Distribution of the Journals That Published the Top 91 Most-Cited Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Total Publication</th>
<th>Total Citations</th>
<th>Citation Per Publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic Medicine</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>37,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Psychiatry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advances in Health Sciences Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>53,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS Care - Psychological and Socio-Medical Aspects of AIDS/HIV</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>85,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthropologischer Anzeiger</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied Ergonomics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australasian Journal of Educational Technology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMC Medical Education</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>447</td>
<td>74,50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Journal of Educational Psychology</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>47,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Psychology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>39,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourse Processes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethos</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Journal of Applied Linguistics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Journal of Psychology of Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Process</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Communication</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Factors</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>88,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interactive Technology and Smart Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Doctoral Studies</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Educational Research</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Nursing Education</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>42,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Journal of Research and Methods in Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Applied Research in Intellectual Disabilities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Communication Disorders</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Community Health</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>32,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Health Communication</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Learning Disabilities</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>73,25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Nursing Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Personality and Social Psychology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>464</td>
<td>154,67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of racial and ethnic health disparities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of School Psychology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>137,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Surgical Education</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>32,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Teaching Research</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>264,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Education</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>482</td>
<td>482,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Education Online</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>53,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Teacher</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>28,33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military Psychology</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31,00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Education in Practice</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>76,50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Education Today</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>973</td>
<td>51,21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thus, it can be said that most published articles are in medicine, while others are published in journals that emphasize education and psychology. Nurse Education Today (f=19), BMC Medical Education (f=6), Journal of Learning Disabilities (f=4), and Journal of Personality and Social Psychology (f=3) are the journals with the highest number of published articles. Additionally, data in Table 2 indicates that journals publishing the most frequently cited 91 articles have a high impact factor.

The studies discussed several research therapies to address mental health issues. These therapies include cognitive behavioral therapy (Beshai et al., 2013), acceptance and commitment therapy (Twohig & Levin, 2017), and stress reduction therapy (Arch & Ayers, 2013). Cognitive behavioral therapy focuses on the relationship between thoughts, emotions, and behaviors, aiming to change unhealthy or unproductive thinking patterns into healthier and more productive ones (Bieling et al., 2022). Acceptance and commitment therapy helps individuals accept and cope with pain or discomfort by accepting their feelings and thoughts without judgment (McCabe, 2015). Stress reduction therapy aims to reduce stress and anxiety through breathing exercises, meditation, or progressive muscle relaxation. The article emphasizes the importance of choosing a suitable treatment to address mental health issues based on individual needs and preferences (Hajra & Saleem, 2021). Therefore, individuals can consider which type of therapy is more suitable for addressing their problems. Overall, this section provides an overview of several treatments that can address mental health issues, especially learning anxiety, helping students improve their mental well-being through Islamic psychology.

**Theme 3: Analysis of Thematic Trends of Publications on The Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology**

Within the scope of the current research, the top 91 most cited publications are analyzed in terms of their topic distribution (most frequently used keywords), and this "thematic trend" is presented in Figure 5.
According to Figure 5, the most frequently used keywords in the top 91 most cited publications, including "learning anxiety" and "psychology" or "Islamic psychology," are anxiety (f=78), nursing student (f=21), survey (f=20), knowledge (f=15), and ability (f=14). Analysis of these 91 articles determined that the keyword "anxiety" is often used in conjunction with one or more of the keywords Outcome, survey, nursing student, knowledge, self, and context.

Most of the articles that were found focused on the impact of Islamic psychological therapy on reducing learning anxiety (Kadafi et al., 2021; Ghiasi & Keramat, 2018; Babamohamadi et al., 2015). These findings indicate that Islamic psychological therapy can effectively reduce learning anxiety, which paves the way for developing more specific intervention strategies and therapies to tackle this issue. Moreover, additional research could be conducted to assess the effectiveness of various psychological therapies and factors that affect the success of these therapies in managing learning anxiety. As Keshavarzi & Haque (2013) suggest, this could reinforce the use of psychological therapy as part of a comprehensive approach to enhancing students' mental well-being and academic performance.

**Theme 4: Analysis of trends of methods in publications on The Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology**

As the main theme within the scope of current research, the "methods" used in the 91 most highly cited publications were analyzed, and their findings were presented separately in Table 3 (methods).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Cited by</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cross-cultural study</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longitudinal Study</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed-methods</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-reviewed</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phenomenological</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>4078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rasch Model</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural equation model</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If Table 3 is examined, it can be seen that four different methods were used in the 91 most highly cited publications. The data obtained indicate that 54 out of the 91 most highly cited publications presented quantitative-based research. At the same time, 13 studies were qualitative, three were literature reviews, and three studies were conducted using mixed methods. Analysis of the "research method/model" used in the 91 most highly cited publications showed that the number of combined studies conducted based on quantitative, qualitative, and experimental methods was fewer than the number of theoretical studies.

Most of the research findings in these articles relate to Islamic psychology, focusing on treating learning anxiety. The research employs experimental designs to assess the effectiveness of learning anxiety treatment by manipulating one or more independent variables to observe their effects on the dependent variable (MacLin, 2020). These findings align with several previous studies on learning anxiety (von der Embse et al., 2013; Stonerock et al., 2015). While experimental designs have advantages in evaluating treatment effectiveness, they also have limitations, such as the potential for biased sampling and generalizability issues from studies with relatively small sample sizes. Conversely, research in the field of Islamic psychology offers a novel approach to addressing mental health problems
by integrating Islamic teachings with psychological principles (Tanhan & Young, 2022). This is consistent with Rassool's view that research in Islamic psychology can provide new perspectives on treating learning anxiety and other mental health issues. Still, it should be conducted with caution and appropriate methodologies to generate reliable and valid results.

**Theme 5: Analysis of population/sample/study group in publications on The Treatment of Learning Anxiety in Islamic Psychology**

The findings obtained in the current study from the analysis of the population where the research was conducted in the reviewed publications revealed that data was collected from populations in various countries. In some publications, data was collected from only one country, while research data was obtained from more than one country in other studies. Within the scope of the current research, data was collected from the analyzed articles, and the countries that collected the most data were the United Kingdom, the United States, and Germany. Figure 6 shows the distribution of sample/study groups from the 91 most highly cited articles examined in the current study.

![Figure 6. Distribution of Research Sample/Study Group in The Top 91 Most-Cited Publications](image)

Based on the findings described in Figure 6, it can be seen that students (f = 45) were the most commonly included in the research sample, followed by pupils (f = 42) and articles (f = 4). When studies in the current research scope are evaluated overall, it can be said that three different types of samples were preferred.

The further noteworthy finding in the discussed articles is that research results indicate the effectiveness of Islamic psychological therapy in reducing learning anxiety and that there are factors influencing the therapy’s effectiveness, such as age, gender, and religious beliefs (Goforth et al., 2014; Saleem & Saleem, 2020). The important implication of this research is that Islamic psychological therapy can be an effective treatment option for addressing learning anxiety and other mental health problems. It is important to consider the factors that influence the effectiveness of therapy in planning and implementing Islamic psychological therapy to improve its efficacy. These research findings provide crucial evidence of the effectiveness of Islamic psychological therapy and pave the way for developing more effective and targeted treatments in Islamic psychology.

4. **CONCLUSION**

The study revealed that cognitive behavioral therapy, acceptance commitment therapy, and stress reduction therapy were the most commonly used methods to treat learning anxiety. However, most studies in this field were conducted in the United Kingdom and the United States, indicating a need for
more research in other regions. Furthermore, the Statistical Analysis showed that psychological interventions, educational practices, and the impact of Islamic beliefs and practices on learning anxiety were the most frequently discussed topics in studies on treating learning anxiety in Islamic psychology. The quality of studies in this area varied, with some studies exhibiting high quality and others exhibiting a risk of bias. Therefore, this study emphasizes the need for further research on the treatment of learning anxiety in Islamic psychology, particularly in other regions. The findings of this study may be useful for academics, researchers, and practitioners in the field of psychology who are interested in the treatment of learning anxiety, as well as for educators who aim to understand better and address the issue of learning anxiety in their students.

REFERENCES


