

IMPLEMENTING GOVERNANCE IN MADRASAH LEADERSHIP: AN ANALYSIS BASED ON THE REGULATION OF THE MINISTER OF RELIGIOUS AFFAIRS NUMBER 24 OF 2018

Marni Basir¹, Kamus², Rahmat Kurniawan³, Saadal Jannah⁴, Nurauliah⁵

¹²³Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri Majene; Indonesia

⁴Institut Agama Islam STIBA Makassar; Indonesia,

⁵Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Al-Gazali Bulukumba; Indonesia

Correspondence E-mail: marnibasir78@gmail.com

Submitted: 12/01/2025

Revised: 11/02/2025

Accepted: 13/03/2025

Published: 22/04/2025

Abstract

This article examines the implementation of madrasah principal governance based on Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency, focusing on planning, implementation, evaluation, and its impact on educational quality. The study employed a qualitative multi-site design involving six public and private madrasahs at the MI, MTs, and MA levels. Data were collected through observation, interviews, and documentation. Informants included the Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Head of the Madrasah Education Section, the Chairperson of the Supervisory Working Group, madrasah supervisors, and madrasah principals. Data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña through data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing and verification. The findings show that the regulation provides a clear legal framework and recruitment mechanism. However, regulatory dissemination, competency development, and principal performance evaluation have not been implemented evenly, particularly in private madrasahs. Public madrasah principals are recruited through open competitive selection, while private madrasah principals are appointed by foundations in coordination with the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Competency development involves collaboration among provincial and regency religious affairs offices and the Makassar Religious Training Center, but it has not reached all principals equally. The implementation of principal performance assessment is also inconsistent. Overall, the regulation has contributed positively to leadership governance and educational quality, although disparities between public and private madrasahs remain.

Keywords

Governance; Madrasah Principal; Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018.



© 2025 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY NC) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>).

INTRODUCTION

Madrasahs occupy a strategic position within the national education system, as they provide not only general education but also foster Islamic values (Apriyani et al., 2025). Their success in fulfilling this dual function is strongly influenced by the quality of the madrasah principal's leadership, since principals are responsible for directing educational provision, managing institutional resources, developing teachers and staff, and ensuring the achievement of educational quality objectives (Azizah & Egar, 2023)). The governance of madrasah principal leadership is therefore a key factor in establishing high-quality, professional, and accountable madrasahs. To strengthen this governance framework, the Ministry of Religious Affairs issued Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs (PMA) Number 24 of 2018, amending PMA Number 58 of 2017 (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam, 2021). This regulation governs the qualifications, competencies, appointment mechanisms, professional development, performance assessment, and dismissal of madrasah principals, reflecting the government's commitment to leadership based on clearly defined standards rather than experience alone—an approach expected to promote professional, transparent, and accountable governance (Firmansyah, 2020).

However, a sound regulatory framework does not guarantee optimal implementation. Previous studies have revealed a persistent gap between the normative provisions of PMA Number 24 of 2018 and actual leadership practices in the field (Fauziyah & Hermawansyah, 2025);(Rohanah et al., 2024). These studies show that principals' managerial competence significantly affects madrasah quality improvement, yet competency development remains uneven across institutions. (Setiawan, 2022) Further notes that performance assessment continues to face challenges related to instrument readiness and consistency of implementation, a finding reinforced by (Triwiyanto et al., 2023), who argue that successful policy implementation depends heavily on how effectively it is disseminated to frontline implementers. Taken together, these studies indicate that regulatory implementation for madrasah principals continues to face several challenges: inadequate policy dissemination, uneven competency development, and inconsistent performance evaluation. However, most prior research has examined only isolated aspects—selection processes, principal competencies, or performance evaluation—in separate studies. Comprehensive research that examines the implementation of PMA Number 24 of 2018 as a whole—covering planning, implementation, evaluation, and supporting/inhibiting factors—while also comparing conditions between public and private madrasahs in the same region, remains limited. This study, therefore,

focuses on the implementation of PMA Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency.

Preliminary observations and interviews at six madrasahs (three public, three private) at the MI, MTs, and MA levels revealed several issues warranting further investigation. *First*, the understanding of the regulation differs notably between public and private principals. The principal of MAN 1 Majene reported having read and applied PMA Number 24 of 2018, largely through a provincial-level dissemination meeting. In contrast, the principal of MA DDI Baruga admitted never having read the regulation directly, relying instead on experience. This disparity suggests that in some madrasahs, leadership governance depends more on personal experience than on established regulatory standards. *Second*, regarding implementation, the appointment of principals generally complies with existing regulations: public madrasahs conduct open competitive selection, while private madrasahs appoint principals through their foundations in coordination with the Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. However, procedural compliance at the recruitment stage has not been matched by systematic post-appointment competency development. Although the five required competency domains are developed through collaboration among the Provincial and Regency Offices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs and the Makassar Religious Training Center, participation depends on available opportunities and individual initiative—meaning that equitable competency development is not yet fully assured.

Third, concerning supporting and inhibiting factors, the preliminary study found that implementation is supported by a clear legal framework, a more transparent selection mechanism, and interinstitutional collaboration in professional development. Nonetheless, significant obstacles persist. The Head of the Madrasah Education Section at the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs acknowledged that dissemination of the regulation has been inadequate, leading to uneven understanding at the madrasah level. Performance assessment is also inconsistent: it is relatively regular in public madrasahs, whereas in several private madrasahs, some principals have served for more than 10 years without any formal evaluation. These findings indicate that implementation of madrasah principal governance under PMA Number 24 of 2018 has not yet fully met expectations. Further investigation is therefore needed to examine how the regulation is implemented across public and private madrasahs in Majene Regency—covering planning, implementation, supporting and inhibiting factors, and comparative differences between the two types of institutions. The findings are expected to contribute to the development of more effective, professional, and equitable governance of madrasah leadership.

METHOD

This study employed a qualitative approach with a multi-site research design to examine the implementation of madrasah principal governance based on Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency. A qualitative approach was selected because the study sought to explore, investigate, and understand phenomena that cannot be adequately captured by hypotheses or numerical data alone (Waruwu, 2023). The study was conducted at six madrasahs representing public and private institutions at each level of education: MAN 1 Majene and MA DDI Baruga at the Madrasah Aliyah level; MTsN 1 Majene and MTs Al-Qalam Teppo at the Madrasah Tsanawiyah level; and MIN 1 Majene and MI GUPPI Binanga at the Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level.

The research data consisted of primary and secondary data (Rachmad et al., 2024)). Primary data were obtained through interviews with six madrasah principals; the Head of the Madrasah Education Section and the Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs; as well as the Head of the Regional Office and the Head of the Madrasah Education Division of the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Secondary data were obtained from documents related to the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018, including decrees on the appointment of madrasah principals, performance reports, professional development documents, and archives of regulatory dissemination activities.

Data were collected through interviews, observations, and documentation (Abubakar, 2021). Observations were conducted from 9 to 13 September 2026, between 9:00 a.m. and 2:00 p.m. Central Indonesian Time (WITA), at the madrasahs selected as research sites in Majene Regency. The observations were undertaken to directly examine the performance of madrasah principals, particularly regarding managerial practices, supervision, and interactions with teachers, educational personnel, students, and other members of the madrasah community. Documentation was used to complement and verify the data obtained through interviews and observations.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Findings

This section presents empirical findings on the implementation of madrasah principal governance under Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency. The data were obtained through observations, interviews, and documentation at six

selected madrasahs, comprising three public and three private institutions at the MI, MTs, and MA levels. The findings are organized according to four dimensions of implementation: planning, implementation, evaluation, and impact. A summary of the findings is presented in Table 1, followed by a narrative discussion of each dimension.

Table 1. Summary of the Implementation of Madrasah Principal Governance Based on Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency

No	Aspect	Public Madrasahs	Private Madrasahs
1	Planning	Regulatory dissemination was provided through a general meeting at the provincial level.	No specific regulatory dissemination activities had been attended.
2	Implementation	Principals were recruited through an online open competitive selection process.	Principals were appointed by their respective foundations in coordination with the Ministry of Religious Affairs.
3	Evaluation	The Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) was conducted annually and every four years.	The Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) had not yet been conducted.
4	Impact	Measurable improvements were observed in instructional quality and institutional governance.	Institutional development largely depended on the individual initiative of the madrasah principal.

Source: Data processed by the researcher, 2026.

Table 1 indicates that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency has not been uniform across public and private madrasahs. Differences were identified across all examined aspects: planning, implementation, evaluation, and their impact on madrasah governance. In general, public madrasahs have implemented the regulation through more structured procedures. In contrast, private madrasahs continue to face several limitations, particularly in disseminating regulations and implementing the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM). These findings provide an initial indication that the implementation of Regulation Number 24 of 2018 differs between the two types of madrasahs. A more detailed discussion of each aspect is presented in the following sections.

In the planning aspect, the main difference lies in the uneven dissemination of the regulation. In terms of implementation, both types of madrasahs have followed the prescribed recruitment mechanisms, but they differ in their approaches to competency development. In terms of evaluation, the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) has been implemented in public madrasahs, but not yet in private madrasahs. These differences across the three aspects have subsequently influenced the governance of madrasah principals in their respective educational institutions.

Planning for the Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The findings indicate that the planning for implementing Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency involved two stages: an analysis of the need for madrasah principals and the dissemination of the regulation. Both stages were undertaken by the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs to lay the foundation for the governance and management of madrasah principals.

About the needs analysis, interviews with the Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs revealed that the determination of the need for madrasah principals was based on the number, qualifications, and competencies of prospective candidates. This process was discussed jointly with the Chairperson of the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group (Pokjawas), madrasah supervisors, and the Head of the Madrasah Education Section. It was coordinated with the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. The Head of the Madrasah Education Section further explained that every policy concerning madrasah principals was formulated with the specific conditions and needs of each educational institution in mind. In addition to the needs analysis, the planning stage also involved disseminating the Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 to madrasah principals. However, the interview findings revealed that the dissemination process had not been implemented evenly across all madrasahs.

In public madrasahs, the principal of MAN 1 Majene stated that his understanding of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 was acquired through provincial-level meetings rather than through a dedicated dissemination program that specifically addressed the regulation's substance. Similar findings were reported by the principals of MTsN 1 Majene and MIN 1 Majene. The principal of MTsN 1 Majene stated that he had attended a specific dissemination session only once while serving at his previous madrasah; however, after being transferred, he had not participated in any similar activity. In contrast to the conditions observed in public madrasahs, private madrasah principals demonstrated a more limited understanding of the regulation. The principal of MA DDI Baruga stated that he had neither read nor understood the provisions of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018, despite having served as principal for more than ten years. This statement was consistent with the accounts provided by the principals of MTs Al-Qalam Teppo and MI GUPPI Binanga, who also reported that they had never participated

in any dissemination activities concerning the regulation. Overall, the findings indicate that planning for the implementation of the Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 was initiated through a needs-analysis mechanism involving relevant stakeholders. However, the dissemination of the regulation has not been conducted evenly, resulting in varying levels of understanding among madrasah principals, particularly between public and private madrasahs.

The findings related to the planning aspect are consistent with the study conducted by Setiawan and Nuraini, which identified planning gaps, particularly in regulatory dissemination, as one of the main factors hindering the effectiveness of policy implementation in practice (Setiawan, 2022). This indicates that dissemination conducted through general meetings or digital platforms, such as WhatsApp groups, has not been sufficiently effective in developing a comprehensive and equitable understanding among all madrasah principals. Therefore, structured, thematic, and multilevel dissemination programs—from the provincial to the regency level—are required to ensure that all madrasah stakeholders share a common understanding of both the substance and the underlying objectives of the regulation.

Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The findings indicate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency encompasses two main aspects: the recruitment of madrasah principals and the development of their competencies. Recruitment is carried out as a follow-up to the needs analysis conducted during the planning stage, whereas competency development is undertaken after the principals have received their official appointments. Regarding the recruitment process, the Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs explained that different mechanisms are applied to public and private madrasahs. Principals of public madrasahs are recruited through an online open competitive selection process administered by the Madrasah Education Division of the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. In contrast, principals of private madrasahs are appointed by their respective foundations in coordination with the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs through the Madrasah Education Section.

This account was corroborated by the Head of the Madrasah Education Section, who stated that the recruitment process had generally followed the applicable procedures. However,

coordination challenges between the foundations and the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs persisted on several occasions. Similarly, the Chairperson of the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group explained that, during the year of the study, the recruitment of madrasah principals involved the supervisory team in the coordination process, thereby making the implementation more systematic and better directed than in previous years.

In addition to recruitment, the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 is also reflected in the competency development of madrasah principals. Based on interviews with the Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Head of the Madrasah Education Section, and the Chairperson of the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group, competency development is carried out through collaboration among the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, and the Makassar Religious Training Center. The development programs cover five dimensions of madrasah principal competence: personal, managerial, entrepreneurial, supervisory, and social. The interview findings further indicated that competency development was implemented through various activities, including training programs, workshops, technical assistance, and other professional development initiatives. However, participation among madrasah principals remained uneven because some programs were limited by participant quotas or depended on individual principals' nomination and readiness.

The findings demonstrate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 in Majene Regency has encompassed both the recruitment and competency development of madrasah principals. The recruitment of madrasah principals is carried out through different mechanisms in public and private madrasahs in accordance with their respective authorities. Meanwhile, competency development has been implemented through collaboration among various stakeholders, although participation has not yet been evenly distributed among all madrasah principals.

Evaluation of the Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The findings indicate that the evaluation of madrasah principals in Majene Regency is conducted periodically through the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM). Information on the evaluation's implementation was obtained through interviews with members of

the evaluation team, officials from the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, and madrasah principals at the six research sites.

Regarding the evaluation process, the Chairperson of the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group (Pokjawas) explained that assessments of madrasah principals have been conducted more consistently in recent periods. According to the informant, the evaluation had not previously been implemented optimally due to several constraints, including the workload of relevant stakeholders and limited interinstitutional coordination. The Head of the Madrasah Education Section provided a similar account, stating that dissemination of information about the evaluation process had only recently begun in several public madrasahs. Meanwhile, the evaluation of principals in private madrasahs was planned to be conducted jointly by the evaluation team in coordination with the Madrasah Education Division of the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs.

Interviews with the madrasah principals revealed differences in the implementation of performance evaluation between public and private madrasahs. The principal of MAN 1 Majene stated that he had undergone the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) twice during his tenure: an annual assessment conducted by a team from the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs and a four-year assessment conducted by a team from the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Similar accounts were provided by the principals of MTsN 1 Majene and MIN 1 Majene, who had participated in the PKKM within the prescribed assessment periods.

In contrast, the principals of private madrasahs reported that they had never undergone a formal performance evaluation. The principal of MA DDI Baruga stated that, despite having served for more than ten years, he had never participated in the PKKM and expressed the expectation that dissemination and evaluation activities would be implemented promptly. Similar statements were made by the principals of MTs Al-Qalam Teppo and MI GUPPI Binanga, who reported that they had never undergone a formal evaluation even though their terms of office had exceeded the stipulated evaluation period.

Based on the findings presented above, the evaluation of madrasah principals in Majene Regency differs between public and private madrasahs. The Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) has been conducted periodically in public madrasahs. In contrast, formal performance evaluations have not yet been administered to all private madrasah principals who

participated as research informants.

The Impact of the Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on the Quality of Madrasah Education

The Head of the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs stated that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018, from the planning and implementation stages to evaluation, has influenced the provision of education in madrasahs. According to the informant, the interrelationship among these three stages determines how effectively madrasah principals perform their duties in managing educational institutions. The informant also emphasized the importance of madrasah principals understanding the various regulations governing education, given their pivotal role in determining the direction of madrasah management.

This account is consistent with the statement of the Head of the Madrasah Education Section, who explained that the impact of regulatory implementation would be more optimal if planning, implementation, and evaluation were carried out collaboratively by all relevant stakeholders. The informant further noted that the dissemination of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 remained limited, including within the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Therefore, more focused dissemination programs concerning education regulations are required. The Chairperson of the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group added that various education regulations had been disseminated through communication platforms such as WhatsApp groups. However, such dissemination had not fully ensured a shared understanding among all madrasah principals, as differences remained in how the regulations were interpreted. Therefore, direct discussion was considered more effective in establishing a common understanding of the applicable regulatory provisions.

Overall, the findings concerning the impact indicate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 is closely related to the provision of education in madrasahs. The informants also emphasized that an adequate understanding of the regulation and the involvement of all relevant stakeholders in the planning, implementation, and evaluation processes constitute integral components of the effective performance of madrasah principals' duties.

Discussion

Planning for the Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the

Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The implementation of governance at the planning stage indicates that the needs analysis for madrasah principals involved various stakeholders, including the Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Madrasah Supervisory Working Group (Pokjawas), and madrasah supervisors, as stipulated in Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 (Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, 2018). The involvement of these stakeholders reflects the governance principle that emphasizes the importance of inter-stakeholder collaboration in decision-making processes (Warjiyati, 2018). Thus, from the perspective of planning formulation, the mechanism applied demonstrates interinstitutional coordination in determining the need for madrasah principals.

Nevertheless, the findings also reveal that the dissemination of the regulation has not been conducted evenly. Public madrasah principals obtained information regarding Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 through provincial-level meetings. In contrast, several private madrasah principals reported that they had neither participated in dissemination activities nor read the regulation. This condition indicates that the involvement of various stakeholders at the planning stage has not been fully accompanied by the equitable distribution of information to all madrasah principals as policy implementers. These findings are consistent with (Setiawan, 2022), who identified limited policy dissemination as one of the factors hindering the effectiveness of policy implementation in practice. Dissemination conducted only through general forums or digital communication platforms has not been sufficient to establish a shared understanding among all madrasah principals. Consequently, the level of regulatory understanding varies from one madrasah to another.

This condition also supports the view of (Nurhayati et al., 2025), who argue that school or madrasah principals are not merely policy implementers but also actors who interpret policies in light of their institutional contexts. When dissemination is not conducted equitably, interpretations of the regulation inevitably vary. In this study, public madrasah principals tended to perform their duties by referring to the regulations they were familiar with. In contrast, several private madrasah principals relied more heavily on their professional experience. They established institutional practices because they had not acquired an adequate understanding of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018.

These findings indicate that the principal challenge at the planning stage does not lie in the policy formulation mechanism but rather in disseminating information to all policy implementers. In Majene Regency, dissemination channels have reached public madrasahs more extensively than private ones, resulting in varying levels of regulatory understanding among their principals. Consequently, the implementation of the regulation has not proceeded with the same level of readiness across the two types of madrasahs.

This condition can also be explained by (Rahardian, 2024) argument that effective communication is essential for successful policy implementation. When information about a new regulation is not disseminated equitably, each madrasah may interpret it differently. This is consistent with the findings of (Yusuf & Mubarakah, 2026), who found that when policy dissemination is inadequate, teachers and school principals tend to perform their duties based on their own judgments. A similar condition was observed among madrasah principals in Majene Regency, who relied more heavily on personal experience when they had not received formal dissemination of the regulation.

Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The findings indicate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 for the recruitment of madrasah principals in Majene Regency has employed different mechanisms based on each madrasah's institutional characteristics. Principals of public madrasahs are recruited through an open competitive selection process administered by the West Sulawesi Provincial Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. In contrast, principals of private madrasahs are appointed by their respective foundations in coordination with the Majene Regency Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. These mechanisms are consistent with the provisions of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 and the technical guidelines for the nomination and appointment of madrasah principals issued by the (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam, 2021)

These findings are consistent with (Fauziyah & Hermawansyah, 2025), who explain that Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 incorporates meritocratic principles into the selection of madrasah principals by emphasizing competence and professionalism. In Majene Regency, the implementation of an open, competitive selection mechanism for public madrasahs indicates that these principles are beginning to be applied in

recruitment. Nevertheless, Fauziah et al. also caution that implementing the merit system may still encounter various challenges at the regional level; therefore, consistency in its application must be maintained. A similar distinction between the recruitment mechanisms of public and private madrasahs has also been identified in previous studies. (Kusumaningrum, 2022) explains that the recruitment of madrasah principals within the Ministry of Religious Affairs is designed to provide an open and equitable process for all candidates. However, its implementation requires effective collaboration between government institutions and education providers, including the foundations that administer private madrasahs.

In contrast to the recruitment process, the findings indicate that competency development for madrasah principals has not been implemented evenly. Development programs addressing the five competency dimensions of madrasah principals—personal, managerial, entrepreneurial, supervisory, and social competencies—as stipulated in Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 and aligned with the School Principal Competency Model established in Regulation of the Director General of Teachers and Education Personnel Number 7327 of 2023, have been conducted through various professional development activities. Nevertheless, the frequency of principals' participation continues to depend on available opportunities and on each principal's individual initiative. Consequently, not all madrasah principals receive competency development with the same level of intensity.

These findings are consistent with several previous studies. (Rohanah et al., 2024) emphasize that managerial competence is crucial to improving madrasah quality. (Hasanah & Subaidi, 2025) demonstrates that entrepreneurial competence can contribute to improving teachers' welfare through the effective management of madrasah business units, whereas (Aoetpah^{*} et al., 2023) stresses that principals' personal competence should be developed through well-planned and continuous training. Similarly, (Ismail, 2020) explains that competency-based selection will produce more optimal outcomes when it is followed by sustained professional development after madrasah principals assume their responsibilities. Other studies also indicate that competency enhancement through structured development programs strengthens the managerial capacity of educational institution leaders to perform planning, organizing, and educational quality control functions (Azizah & Egar, 2023). Compared with these findings, competency development in Majene Regency still varies in terms of implementation frequency. Consequently, opportunities for competency development have not yet been distributed equally among all madrasah principals.

The findings indicate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 has been more effective at the recruitment stage than at the competency development stage. The recruitment mechanism has relatively clear procedures and has been implemented in accordance with the applicable provisions, whereas competency development has not yet been provided equitably to all madrasah principals. This condition indicates that the success of regulatory implementation should be measured not only by the conformity of the appointment process but also by the continuity of competency development after madrasah principals assume their responsibilities. Therefore, strengthening well-planned development programs that reach all madrasah principals is essential to achieving the objectives of Regulation Number 24 of 2018 in improving the quality of madrasah leadership.

In addition to general competency development, the ability of madrasah principals to guide teachers constitutes an important component of their responsibilities. (Rahardian, 2024) explains that guidance and supervision provided by madrasah principals can improve teachers' instructional practices. Similarly (Teddy & Kholid, 2024) found that managerial competence in administering madrasahs significantly influences the fulfillment of national education standards. Other studies also indicate that effective school leadership contributes to the overall improvement of educational quality (Fauzi, 2025); (Jumsir et al., 2025). Thus, the successful performance of madrasah principals is determined not only by the recruitment process but also by their continually developing capacities to supervise teachers and manage madrasahs effectively.

Evaluation of the Implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency

The findings indicate that the implementation of the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment (PKKM) in Majene Regency has not been evenly distributed. PKKM has been conducted periodically in public madrasahs, whereas formal evaluation has not yet been implemented in private madrasahs. Technically, the implementation of PKKM is regulated by the guidelines for madrasah principal performance assessment issued by the Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam (2021) Ministry, which cover the dimensions of madrasah development, managerial competence, entrepreneurship, supervision, and work performance.

These findings are consistent with (Setiawan, 2022), who demonstrated that the primary challenge in principal performance assessment lies not in the availability of assessment instruments, but in the consistency of their implementation in practice. A similar condition was identified in

Majene Regency. Although PKKM instruments and implementation guidelines are available, their application has reached public madrasahs more extensively than private madrasahs.

This phenomenon can be explained through the perspective of Howlett and Cashore, as cited by (Nurhayati et al., 2025), who argue that regulatory policies generally require a longer implementation process than incentive-based policies. Regulatory policies require not only compliance with established rules but also organizational readiness, changes in governance practices, and adequate technical support. In the context of this study, these requirements are reflected in the implementation of PKKM in private madrasahs, which has not progressed to the same extent as in public madrasahs, despite the availability of the relevant regulation and assessment instruments.

These findings are also consistent with (Nurhasanah, 2023), who found that although progress has been made in managerial and administrative aspects, the consistent and equitable implementation of evaluation remains a challenge across various types of madrasah institutions. In Majene Regency, this condition is reflected in the disparity in PKKM coverage between public and private madrasahs. This disparity indicates that the evaluation of madrasah principals has not yet been implemented equitably and that the regulation's effectiveness remains influenced by institutional readiness and coordination among stakeholders.

Thus, the findings demonstrate that the main challenges in implementing PKKM in Majene Regency do not lie in the availability of regulations or assessment instruments, but in the consistency and equitable coverage of their implementation across all madrasahs. Therefore, stronger coordination among the Ministry of Religious Affairs, madrasah supervisors, and the foundations administering private madrasahs is essential to ensure that the evaluation mechanism is implemented more equitably in accordance with the mandate of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018.

In addition to the availability of assessment instruments, the assessors also play an important role in the evaluation process. (Susanti, 2023) explains that principal performance assessments should be conducted regularly because the results can serve as a basis for subsequent professional development. This view is reinforced by Hasan & Firdaus (2023), who found that madrasah supervisors play a crucial role in assessing the performance of madrasah principals, from the preparation and implementation stages through to reporting. However, their study also revealed that supervisors often face staffing limitations and extensive areas of responsibility, which prevent

assessments from being conducted equitably. This condition also helps explain the uneven implementation of PKKM between public and private madrasahs in Majene Regency.

Impact: Educational Quality as Determined by the Completeness of the Implementation Cycle

The findings indicate that the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 has a positive impact on the quality of madrasah education when all stages of implementation—including regulatory dissemination, recruitment, competency development, and evaluation—are carried out continuously and in an integrated manner. In madrasahs where these stages have been implemented more comprehensively, leadership governance is more systematic, and educational quality improvement can be managed more effectively. Conversely, in madrasahs where dissemination, competency development, and evaluation have not been implemented optimally, quality improvement remains highly dependent on the individual initiative of each madrasah principal.

These findings support the view of (Triwiyanto et al., 2023), who argue that the effectiveness of educational leadership is influenced not only by individual capacity but also by policy governance and stakeholder involvement throughout the implementation process. In the context of Majene Regency, the impact of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 is determined not merely by the regulation's existence but also by the consistent implementation at each stage. Such consistency is necessary to ensure that all madrasah principals have equal opportunities to understand and implement the regulation and to have their performance evaluated in accordance with the applicable provisions.

The findings also reinforce (Mulyasa, 2013) view that madrasah principals serve as key actors in determining the success of educational provision. Therefore, the quality of madrasah leadership is shaped not only by principals' personal competencies but also by the professional development system and governance mechanisms that support the performance of their duties. This study demonstrates that differences in implementation quality at the dissemination, competency development, and evaluation stages have contributed to differences in governance quality between public and private madrasahs, even though both operate under the same regulatory framework.

The differing impacts observed between public and private madrasahs are also consistent with (Agus, 2024), who found that school principal leadership is closely associated with overall school quality. The more effective the leadership, the higher the quality of education produced. In addition, a comparative study by Hasan & Firdaus (2023) of public and private schools demonstrates

that differences in resources and institutional support influence the quality of learning in both types of institutions, a pattern also evident among public and private madrasahs in Majene Regency. Meanwhile, (Shobri, 2024) emphasizes that information transparency and clear accountability in the management of Islamic educational institutions can strengthen public trust in madrasahs. Therefore, equitable regulatory dissemination, competency development, and performance evaluation should be continuously strengthened to ensure that both public and private madrasahs can provide comparable educational services.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, the implementation of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 on Madrasah Principals in Majene Regency has encompassed the planning, implementation, and evaluation stages. It has influenced the quality of madrasah leadership. However, its implementation has not been equitable across public and private madrasahs. At the planning stage, the needs analysis for madrasah principals has been conducted in accordance with the applicable provisions. Still, regulatory dissemination remains limited, resulting in an inadequate level of understanding among madrasah principals, particularly those in private madrasahs. At the implementation stage, the recruitment mechanisms have complied with the established procedures, whereas competency development continues to depend on available opportunities and the individual initiative of each madrasah principal. At the evaluation stage, the Madrasah Principal Performance Assessment has been implemented consistently in public madrasahs but has not yet been conducted in private madrasahs. These differences across implementation stages have resulted in disparities in the quality of madrasah leadership and governance. Therefore, the effectiveness of Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 24 of 2018 is determined not only by the existence of the regulation itself but also by the consistent and equitable implementation of regulatory dissemination, competency development, and performance evaluation for all madrasah principals.

REFERENCES

- Abubakar. (2021). *Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian*. Suka-Press UIN Sunan Kalijaga.
- Agus, S. (2024). Hubungan Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Terhadap Mutu Kinerja Sekolah. *Risalah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Studi Islam*, 10(2), 666–693.
- Aoetpah, S.T, S., & Wasitohadi. (2023). Pengembangan Modul Belajar Mandiri tentang Kepemimpinan Pendidikan Berbasis Competence Based Training untuk Meningkatkan Kompetensi Kepribadian Guru. *Kelola: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 10(2), 174–186. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24246/j.jk.2023.v10.i2.p174-186>
- Apriyani, S, S., & M, M. (2025). Peran Madrasah Sebagai Institusi Pendidikan Islam. *Learning : Jurnal Inovasi Penelitian Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 4(4), 1274–1283. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.51878/learning.v4i4.4086>
- Azizah, N., & Egar, N. (2023). Pengaruh Kompetensi Manajerial Kepala Madrasah, Budaya Madrasah Dan Disiplin Kerja Guru Terhadap Mutu Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Di Kabupaten Kendal. *Didaktik: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD FKIP Universitas Mandiri*, 7(1), 14–29. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.36989/didaktik.v9i2.890>
- Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam. (2021). *Keputusan Direktur Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Nomor 3932 Tahun 2021 tentang Petunjuk Teknis Pencalonan dan Pengangkatan Kepala Madrasah*. Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam, Kementerian Agama RI.
- Fauzi, I. (2025). Membangun Tim Unggul: Strategi Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan. *Jurnal Penelitian Kebijakan Pendidikan*, 17(2), 99–112.
- Fauziyah, I., & Hermawansyah. (2025). Tinjauan Implementatif Manajemen Seleksi Kepala Madrasah terhadap PMA No. 24 Tahun 2018. *AL-QALAM: Jurnal Kajian Islam dan Pendidikan*, 17(2), 557–573. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.47435/al-qalam.v17i2.4161>
- Firmansyah. (2020). Pengaruh Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia Nomor 24 Tahun 2018 Tentang Kepala Madrasah Terhadap Kualitas Pendidikan di Madrasah Tsanawiyah dan Madrasah Aliyah di Kabupaten Indramayu. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 12(2), 123–136.
- Hasan, A. R., & Firdaus, A. B. (2023). Peran Pengawas Madrasah Dalam Penilaian Kinerja Kepala Madrasah Di Kabupaten Blitar. *Re-JIEM: Research Journal of Islamic Education Management*, 6(2), 140–152.
- Hasanah, & Subaidi. (2025). Peran Kompetensi Kewirausahaan Kepala Madrasah dalam Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Guru di MAN 2 Kudus Tahun Pelajaran 2024/2025. *Jurnal Riset Rumpun Ilmu Pendidikan (JURRIPEN)*, 4(1).
- Ismail. (2020). *Kemitraan Strategis dalam Pengelolaan Pendidikan*. Graha Ilmu.
- Jumsir, Rosmiati, Jusriyanti, & Hasriyanti. (2025). Peran Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah dalam Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Pendidikan. *Journal of Innovative and Creativity*, 5(4).
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2018). *PMA Nomor 24 Tahun 2018 Tentang Kepala Madrasah*. Kementrian Agama.
- Kusumaningrum, H. (2022). Manajemen Strategi Rekrutmen Kepala Madrasah Yang Responsif Gender di Lingkungan Kementerian Agama RI. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, 8(9), 354–363.
- Mulyasa. (2013). *Manajemen dan Kepemimpinan Kepala Madrasah*. Bumi Aksara.
- Nurhasanah. (2023). Kinerja Kepala Madrasah Tsanawiyah Berdasarkan Standar PMA No. 24 Tahun 2018. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1).
- Nurhayati, A, S., & F, S. (2025). Aktor Kebijakan sebagai Penggerak Perubahan: Studi Kasus Implementasi Kebijakan Pendidikan. *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran*, 8(2), 5925–

5935.

- Rachmad. (2024). *Integrasi Metode Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif: Panduan Praktis Penelitian Campuran*. PT. Green Pustaka Indonesia.
- Rahardian. (2024). *Teori-Teori Governansi dan Kebijakan Publik Kontemporer*. BRIN.
- Rohanah, R., Y, C., & N, P. (2024). Kompetensi Manajerial Kepala Madrasah dalam Pengembangan Mutu di MTsN Lombok Barat. *Jurnal Ilmiah Profesi Pendidikan*, 9(1), 82–85. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.29303/jipp.v9i1.1921>
- Setiawan, D. (2022). Penilaian Kinerja Kepala Sekolah dan Guru Muhammadiyah Kecamatan Tempel. *Academy of Education Journal*, 13(1), 164–178.
- Shobri. (2024). Peran Sistem Informasi Manajemen Pendidikan dalam Meningkatkan. *AKSI: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 10(2), 666–693.
- Susanti, S. (2023). Analisis Fungsi Penilaian Kinerja Kepala Sekolah (PKKS) Sebagai Supervisor Pendidikan. *Iluminasi: Journal of Research in Education*, 1(1), 1–10.
- Teddy, T., & Kholid, A. (2024). Kompetensi Manajerial Kepala Madrasah dalam Pengelolaan Delapan Standar Nasional Pendidikan di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Negeri 1 Batanghari. *ARMADA: Jurnal Penelitian Multidisiplin*, 2(3), 168–178. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.55681/armada.v2i3.1242>
- Triwiyanto, A, N., & R.B, S. (2023). Sistem Manajemen Pembiayaan Pendidikan, Partisipasi Masyarakat, Kepemimpinan, dan Mutu Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Pendidikan*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.23887/jppp.v7i1.54509>
- Warjiyati. (2018). Tinjauan Hukum Islam terhadap Penerapan Good Governance dalam Pelayanan Publik. *Hukum Islam*, 18(1), 119–135.
- Waruwu. (2023). Pendekatan Penelitian Pendidikan: Metode Penelitian Kualitatif , Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Metode Penelitian Kombinasi (Mixed Method). *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 7(1), 2896–2910. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/jptam.v7i1.6187>
- Yusuf, M., & Mubarakah, M. (2026). Optimalisasi Pengelolaan Arsip dan Sumber Daya Manusia dalam Lembaga Pendidikan. *Jurnal Pelita Pendidikan*, 3(1), 246–263.